

The World Bank's influence on the educational policy of the State of Paraná

A influência do Banco Mundial na política educacional do Estado do Paraná

La influencia del Banco Mundial en la política educativa del Estado de Paraná

Mayara Haruka Watanabe Iijimaⁱ

Western Paraná State University
Cascavel, PR, Brazil

may_ijijima@hotmail.com

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6877-6348>

Isaura Monica Souza Zanardiniⁱⁱ

Western Paraná State University
Cascavel, PR, Brazil

monicazan@uol.com.br

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2226-3840>

Contribution in the elaboration of the text: Author 1 – collection of primary and secondary sources, data analysis, systematization of the text. Author 2 – research supervision, data analysis, systematization of the text.

Received in: 02/25/2022

Accepted in: 04/29/2022

Published in: 05/19/2022

Linhas Críticas | Scientific journal of the Faculty of Education of the University of Brasília, Brazil
ISSN: 1516-4896 | e-ISSN: 1981-0431
Volume 28, 2022 (jan-dec).
<http://periodicos.unb.br/index.php/linhascriticas>

Reference (APA):

Iijima, M. H. W., & Zanardini, I. M. S. (2022). The World Bank's influence on the educational policy of the State of Paraná. *Linhas Críticas*, 28, e42092. <https://doi.org/10.26512/lc28202242092>

Alternative link:

<https://periodicos.unb.br/index.php/linhascriticas/article/view/42092>

Creative Commons license [CC BY 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



Abstract: This article discusses the influence of the World Bank regarding the educational policies implemented in the State of Paraná. Thus, the Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica (Quality of Basic Education Project) in Paraná, approved in 1994, and the Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná (Multi-sector Project) for the Development of Paraná, instituted in 2012, stand out. The education project disseminated by this international organization is sustained and negotiated according to the interests of the internal policy of Paraná and incorporates aspects of the business field, resulting in the intensification of evaluative processes, the search for efficiency and effectiveness, and the participation and accountability of the subjects in favor of better results.

Keywords: World Bank. Educational policies. Education Productivity. Education Evaluation. Quality of Education.

Resumo: Este artigo objetiva apresentar a influência do Banco Mundial no que diz respeito às políticas educacionais implementadas no Estado do Paraná. Sendo assim, destacam-se o Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica (PQE) no Paraná, aprovado em 1994, e o Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná, instituído em 2012. O projeto de educação disseminado por esse organismo internacional é sustentando e negociado de acordo com os interesses da política interna paranaense e incorpora aspectos do campo empresarial, resultando na intensificação de processos avaliativos, na busca pela eficiência e eficácia e na participação e responsabilização dos sujeitos em prol de melhores resultados.

Palavras-chave: Banco Mundial. Políticas educacionais. Produtividade da Educação. Avaliação da Educação. Qualidade da educação.

Resumen: Este artículo pretende presentar la influencia del Banco Mundial en las políticas educativas implementadas en el Estado de Paraná. Así, destacan el Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica (PQE) en Paraná aprobado en 1994 y el Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná em 2012. El proyecto educativo difundido por este organismo internacional se sustenta y negocia de acuerdo con los intereses de la política interna de Paraná e incorpora aspectos del ámbito empresarial que se traducen en la intensificación de los procesos de evaluación, en la búsqueda de eficiencia y eficacia y en la participación y responsabilización de los sujetos en pro de mejores resultados.

Palabras clave: Banco Mundial. Políticas educativas. Productividad de la educación. Evaluación de la educación. Calidad de la educación.

ⁱ Master's in Education from the Western Paraná State University (Unioeste) (2021).

ⁱⁱ PhD in Education from the State University of Campinas (UNICAMP) (2006). Teacher at the Western Paraná State University in the Pedagogy Course and in the Graduate Program in Education.

Introduction

This article is the result of bibliographic and documentary research, based on international and national primary sources that guide educational policy in the State, and the central scope is to present the influence of the World Bank with concerning educational policies implemented in the State of Paraná. The documents analyzed are considered from the historical dimension and the understanding of social relations established in the material base of society.

In general terms, it can be stated that the World Bank Group is made up of five institutions: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD), International Development Association (IDA), International Finance Corporation (IFC), Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency (MIGA) and International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID). Initially, in 1944, its actions were aimed at rebuilding the infrastructure of post-World War II countries. Today, with a significant capacity to act, the World Bank acts in the implementation of strategies to alleviate poverty and foster shared prosperity in countries considered to be developing. However, for this to happen, it exerts influence in various areas of development, including education.

We emphasize that the influence of this international body can be understood "[...] through the establishment of the agenda of issues to be considered, the priorities set, the conceptions based on which public policies are defined, and even the explicit conditioning of policies." (Vior & Cerruti, 2014, p. 113). Thus, it is possible to state that the implementation of social policies, which include education, does not result from an imposition made by this international organization, but from the complex correlation of forces and interests that permeate a country and the set of its states.

We understand that the World Bank is a policy inducer and that its guidelines are not an imposition, but rather there is a relationship of negotiation of internal and external interests and, therefore, of intervention and consent, as Silva (2002) argues. Given of this, we aim to present the influence of the World Bank in the implementation of policies aimed at the area of education in the State of Paraná, considering that the conditionalities of this international organization, met by the national elite, are related to the promotion of a particular societal project that remains in the orientation of social relations established in capitalist society.

To address this influence, we highlight some of the actions developed in the governments of Roberto Requião de Mello e Silva (1991-1994), Jaime Lerner (1995-1998), and Carlos Alberto Richa (2011-2017). We draw attention, above all, to the contract signed between the IBRD and the Government of the State of Paraná - Guarantee Contract for the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* (Quality of Basic Education Project) in Paraná number 3766/BR - in 1994, in the amount of US\$96 million (Sousa, 2013), and to the *Documento de Avaliação do Projeto do Empréstimo Proposto* (Project Evaluation Document of the Proposed Loan), prepared by the World Bank (Banco Mundial, 2012), in the amount of US\$350 million for the State of Paraná, with the Guarantee of the Federative Republic of Brazil.

The analysis of the documents produced by the World Bank, selected from the Bank's website for this study as primary sources, shows the preponderance of this international organization beyond the financial aspect, indicating its influence on the dissemination of guidelines for the implementation of educational policies, as well as the discourses and justifications that underlie them.

Based on a qualitative methodological approach, related to the survey of specific sources of the State of Paraná, we searched selectively on the website of the Paraná *Instituto Paranaense de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social* - Ipardes - (Institute of Economic and Social Development), the following documents as primary sources of this article: the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* (Project Operational Manual) volume 1 (Paraná, 2014a), which presents the description of the do *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná* (Multisector Project for the Development of Paraná), paying attention to the commitments made in the Loan Agreement signed between the World Bank and the State of Paraná; and the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* volume 4 (Paraná, 2014b), which deals specifically with the programs that make up the Education sector of the Project in Paraná: *Formação em Ação* (Formation in Action), *Renova Escola* (Renovate School), and *Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem* (Learning Assessment System).

Both the World Bank guiding documents and the state policies implemented in Paraná (Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica and Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná) and presented in this article were analyzed from the context of their production. This is in line with the methodological assumption that, to understand the influence of the World Bank on the educational policy of Paraná, it is necessary to consider the set of social relations present in capitalist society and the implications produced on educational policies, in the direction of what Shiroma et al. (2005) guide:

The recommendations present in educational policy documents widely disseminated in print and digital media are not readily assimilable or applicable. Their implementation requires that they be translated, interpreted, and adapted according to the vicissitudes and political games that shape the field of education in each country, region, and locality; such process implies, in a way, a rewriting of the prescriptions, which poses to scholars the task of understanding the rationality that informs them and that often seems contradictory, fostering measures that appear to go in the opposite direction of what they propose. (Shiroma et al., 2005, pp. 430-431)

To present the reflections developed, we structured this article into two sections: in the first, entitled The *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* in Paraná funded by the World Bank, we deal with a specific project for the area of education – the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* –, demonstrating that its main objective (the improvement of the schooling of elementary school students) was based on shared management and founded on the policy of schools as centers of excellence; In the second, called Education in the Multisectoral Project for Development in Paraná financed by the World Bank, we present the main objectives of this project in the area of education, such as improving the quality of education, reducing age/grade

distortion, and improving the school environment. To this end, the programs defined to achieve these goals were: the Learning Assessment System, Training in Action, and *Renova Escola*.

The *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* in Paraná is funded by the World Bank

Although the first negotiations of the Paraná State government with the World Bank were successful starting in 1987, the period that corresponds to the inauguration of Governor Álvaro Dias (1987-1991), as stated by Gonçalves et al. (2003), in this study we consider, for the analysis of the negotiations with the World Bank, the administration of Governor Roberto Requião (1991-1994), of the *Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro* (Brazilian Democratic Movement), because it was during this administration that the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* in Paraná began to be designed.

During Requião's administration, it was possible to observe, according to Gonçalves et al. (2003), that the projects focused on education were inserted into the logic of the state's development and its ability to compete. In this context, the decisions, to a great extent, were influenced by the Planning Secretary. The aforementioned authors mention:

The initial option of the Planning Secretariat was for an investment focused on the creation of some technical schools (2nd degree), or better, technical centers similar to the schools in Quebec (Canada), that the Planning Secretary had visited, which could train high-level technicians and provide the state with qualified labor in cutting-edge areas, interfering with the still predominant agricultural profile of the state. (Gonçalves et al., 2003, p. 87)

However, aware of the conditionalities determined by the World Bank about the return that basic education (especially elementary school) could offer, the State of Paraná, at first, sought World Bank financing for primary education. In the view of the Secretary of Planning of the State of Paraná, this action was necessary so that, later, it would be possible to obtain the approval of World Bank resources to finance technical high schools, the central objective of this administration (Gonçalves et al., 2003).

After negotiations that began in 1992, the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* for Primary Education was approved in 1994 in a contract signed between the Paraná State government and the World Bank (Gonçalves et al., 2003; Figueiredo, 2005; Sousa, 2013). On the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica*, Gonçalves et al. (2003) and De Tommasi (2007) point out that the Paraná project went through two formulations: the first was close to the São Paulo state project, and the second to the Minas Gerais project.

Concerning to the external loans granted by the World Bank to the State of Paraná, the state needed to adapt to the requirements imposed. Among them, according to De Tommasi (2007), where the adoption of the process of municipalization of education and support for decentralization, resulted in the autonomy of schools. In addition, "[...] the Bank requires the

states to take responsibility for supplying the books to the schools, regardless of the fulfillment of their obligations by the Federal Government." (De Tommasi, 2007, p. 206). Also, in the search for efficiency, the World Bank imposed a state of competition among school institutions, since it established criteria for approval of funding, such as the presence of the innovative character of the projects presented by the schools, to reduce the high rates of repetition.

Following this direction, Sousa (2013, p. 85) highlights the recommendations made by the World Bank for the education of the State of Paraná:

In the guaranteed contract for the Quality of Basic Education Project in Paraná number 3766/BR, signed in 1994 with the IBRD of 96 million dollars, the Bank establishes obligations to the borrower not only in the financial sense, when it imposes a counterpart of 102 million dollars but also in the political sense when it establishes the directions of the project. Among the Bank's guidelines, educational management in a broad way is significantly presented, following the same logic of efficiency presented in the State Reform. In the contract, the guidelines agreed upon with the Bank for Education in Paraná are made explicit: decentralization in line with participation, autonomy, and accountability as essential mechanisms to build schools of excellence.

Thus, it is important to point out that we understand the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* from the perspective of the transnational regulation of educational policies, as well as the reformed state and the role it plays in the context of implementing educational projects. In the middle of this context, in 1995, there was a change in the management of the state government, which was under the responsibility of Jaime Lerner (1995-1998), who, through the Secretariat of Education, defined the Action Plans I and II to guide educational activities. According to Figueiredo (2005), the actions foreseen in these plans are part of the action components defined in the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica*.

The *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* had the proclaimed goal of increasing the schooling of students from the municipal and state networks, encompassing students from 1st to 8th grade. Following the national reality, in a context signaled by the State Reform, Lerner's government stressed the need for shared management, whose valorization of the school and the teachers who worked there was a relevant characteristic of this form of management (Figueiredo, 2005).

In Sousa's (2013, p. 91) view, shared management translated into some basic principles, such as:

[...] schools as centers of excellence; partnerships with the community to achieve success in meeting the goals of excellence; strengthening the decentralized management of SEED-PR¹ as support in developing the competence of the system; valuing the education profession

¹ SEED-PR - *Secretaria da Educação e do Esporte do Paraná* (Secretary of Education and Sports of Paraná).

through the expansion of its competence; the involvement of the external and internal community to the school taken as fundamental in the evaluation process; and the systematization and access to information. These principles would be the basis for the implementation of the decision-making process and educational innovations.

As noted in the excerpt, Sousa (2013) points out that the proposal of shared management of education in the Lerner government, the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica*, and the *Programa Expansão, Melhoria e Inovação no Ensino Médio do Paraná* (Program Expansion, Improvement and Innovation in High School in Paraná) were based on the policy of the school of excellence, which revolved around "categories such as competition, accountability, evaluation and awarding" (Sousa, 2013, p. 87), being guided by the neoliberal propositions of international organizations. This corroborated the documents that were produced after the World Conference on Education for All, held in Jomtien in 1990, and the logic of efficiency presented in the State Reform.

As for the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica*, to achieve its goals, this program directed its actions based on five components: pedagogical materials and equipment; training of human resources in education; physical network; institutional development; and studies, research, and evaluation (Figueiredo, 2005).

In all these discussions, it is necessary to deconstruct the belief that the projects financed by the World Bank result only from ready-made requirements imposed by this international organization and that should be put into practice by the borrowing countries. On the contrary, we observe, according to Nogueira et al. (2003), that there was a flexibilization on the part of the World Bank during the implementation of the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* project, based on internal demands. The authors argue:

What was possible to verify is that the World Bank technicians, in negotiation with the SEED-PR technicians, in the process of approving the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* project, reallocated items from other action programs to the "Institutional Development" and "Teacher Training" programs. These two action programs were effectively the ones with the greatest impact, both in terms of restructuring the state apparatus [...], and in terms of the ideological impact that they had on teachers, the school community in general, and parents/*Associação de pais e mestres* (Parent-Teacher Association). (Nogueira et al. 2003, p. 91).

It is also worth mentioning the possibility of changes in ongoing projects, changes that occurred in component 1, and pedagogical material. The main goal of the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* was to promote the universalization of Primary Education in the State, improving the national indexes. To attain this goal and combat age/grade distortion, in one of its actions, the *Secretaria da Educação e do Esporte do Paraná* included, in the pedagogical material

component, the printing of didactic material for the Flow Correction Program (Nogueira et al., 2003).

Therefore, understanding that the World Bank policy for education is not an imposition, but is the result of a game of international and national forces and interests, Pronko (2014) reinforces that:

This perspective is fundamental to overcome the double misunderstanding of thinking of the WB's action as an intervention from outside to inside (therefore, an overdetermination of the international sphere over the national one) and as a unilateral imposition of which local governors would be victims. (Pronko, 2014, p. 90)

In what specifically refers to the quality of education desired by the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica*, evaluation, and control mechanisms were adopted, such as the *Avaliação do Rendimento Escolar* (School Performance Evaluation), which was supposed to provide more accurate information about the school's reality and thus serve as a tool to guide the pedagogical work.

What we found is that this new form of school management, linked to the need for evaluation of results in search of improved educational quality, reflected the updating of the neoliberal ideology that occurred in the 1990s. Melo (2005) called this process of redefinition of educational policies, which is conducted by hegemonic groups with support in the guidelines of international organizations such as the World Bank, the globalization of education, as part of the process of capitalist globalization.

Sousa (2013), referring to the government of Carlos Alberto Richa, in Paraná, also takes up some of the World Bank assumptions, as was done in the Jaime Lerner government. The author asserts:

In the same logic as the Lerner government, the state needs to become more efficient to improve public management, with more action in the public and economic sector and at the same time reduce state spending. To do this, it is fundamental to convene and convince society of the importance of its participation to improve Paraná. The idea empowerment, cooperation, of accountability, of partnerships, is present as a central strategy of this government. In this sense, in educational management, collegiate bodies are encouraged to participate, mainly as a means of assuming state responsibility for school improvements and obtaining more resources. (Sousa, 2013, pp. 98-99)

Based on the assumptions of the World Bank, which conform to the logic present in the Brazilian State Reform, the government of Carlos Alberto Richa, in Paraná, takes up some of these elements of neoliberal character, such as: "[...] cutting public spending, reducing

bureaucracy, decentralization, greater emphasis on the market and public-private partnerships." (Sousa, 2013, p. 99).

About Carlos Alberto Richa's government and its relations with international organizations, especially the World Bank, through the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*, we will discuss the following.

Education in the World Bank-financed *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*

In Sousa's (2013) view, discussing the role of the World Bank in the state of Paraná presupposes studying the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*, prepared by the government of Carlos Alberto Richa to obtain loans from the World Bank. In this document, it is possible to identify convergences with the recommendations and guidelines of this international organization. To this end, it is essential to read documents such as the World Bank Report No. 67388-BR (Banco Mundial, 2012), which deals with the Project Evaluation of the proposed US\$350 million World Bank Loan to the State of Paraná, the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* volumes 1 (Paraná, 2014a) and 4 (Paraná, 2014b), the *Modelo Lógico Formação em Ação* - Training in Action Logic Model - (Ipardes, 2012a), the *Modelo Lógico Programa Renova Escola* - Renova School Program Logic Model - (Ipardes, 2012b), and the *Programa Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem* - Learning Assessment System Program - (Ipardes, 2012c).

In his studies, Camargo (2018) examined the political, ideological, financial, and educational conditionalities for the financing of educational policy, present in the documents of the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*, implemented in the state during the management of Carlos Alberto Richa's governments (2011-2017).

To finance it, the State of Paraná contracted several loans with the World Bank, which were accompanied by several conditionalities, be they political, ideological, and/or financial. As such, to study these conditionalities "[...] is to try to uncover what the intentionalities behind their financing are." (Camargo, 2018, p. 54).

The total cost of the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná* was US\$713.24 million. The World Bank was responsible for financing a portion, corresponding to the value of US\$ 350 million, and the rest of the counterpart would be up to the State (Banco Mundial, 2012). According to the *Manual Operativo de Projeto*, the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná* aimed to make access to economic and human development opportunities fairer and more sustainable, based on a "New Way of Governing," characterized by results-oriented management. The project was based on the so-called *Abordagem Setorial Ampla* (sector-wide approach), with the involvement of the State Secretariats of Education, Health, Agriculture, Environment, Finance, Administration, and Social Security and Planning. According to the first volume of the *Manual Operativo de Projeto*:

The proposal of the Project is in line with the government's strategy for the development of Paraná, which aims to build a "New Way of Government", aiming at the introduction of management focused on results. This posture, responsible and innovative, will be built from the development of management skills, the renewal of working methods and government structures, in truly new management, focused on effective results. (Paraná, 2014a, p. 11)

As mentioned earlier, the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná* is articulated with the guidelines and proposals of the World Bank. It is possible to observe this connection in one of its documents - *Um Brasil mais justo, sustentável e competitivo: estratégia de assistência ao país 2004 – 2007* (A fairer, more sustainable, and more competitive Brazil: Country Assistance Strategy 2004-2007) (Banco Mundial, 2003) -, in which the World Bank defines elements of the development vision of a fairer, more sustainable, and more competitive Brazil.

The World Bank (Banco Mundial, 2003) also states that these three dimensions of the vision for Brazil - fair, sustainable, and competitive - are related and, therefore, the assistance program of this international agency is multisectoral in nature. As such, "It emphasizes combining the activities of a group of sectors to achieve a common goal (for example, the initiatives in health, water and education to reduce infant mortality)" (Banco Mundial, 2003, p. 78).

In this direction, to guarantee a strategy that is structured and adjusted at the state level, the loans directed to the states have this multi-sectorial character. This is the case, for example, in the definition of the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*. The actions of this project were organized in two components: Component 1 - Fair and Environmentally Sustainable Promotion of Economic and Human Development, which is organized into four subcomponents (1.1 Sustainable Rural Development; 1.2 Environmental and Risk and Disaster Management; 1.3 Education; and 1.4 Health); and Component 2 - Technical Assistance for More Efficient and Effective Public Management, which encompasses technical and financial support actions for the implementation of Component 1 and public sector management modernization activities, divided, in turn, into eight subcomponents (2. 1 Fiscal Quality; 2.2 Institutional Modernization; 2.3 More Efficient Human Resource Management; 2.4 Support to Agriculture with Low Environmental Impact; 2.5 Support to the Modernization of the Environmental Management System; 2.6 Support to Natural and Anthropogenic Risk Management; 2.7 Education; and 2.8 Health).

In this article, we discuss specifically subcomponents 1.3 and 2.7, which deal with education. According to the *Manual Operativo de Projeto*, the main actions for these subcomponents focus on the following objectives: a) improving the quality of education; b) reducing age/grade distortion and seeking to ensure students' permanence and completion of school years; and c) improving the school environment.

In the education subcomponent, the *Programa Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem*, one of the *Programas de Gastos Elegíveis* (Eligible Expenditure Programs), is being implemented.

It is worth noting that the *Programas de Gastos Elegíveis* are considered budget initiatives in the 2012-2015 Pluriannual Plan and in Law No. 17,012 of December 14, 2011, which estimated the revenue and set the expenses for the 2012 fiscal year (Paraná, 2011), corresponding to the actions of Component 1, which aims to foster the economic and social development of the state of Paraná (Paraná, 2014a). With the *Programa Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem*, the state government seeks to achieve the goals set by the federal government for the educational field. Thus, it is understood that it is necessary to measure learning outcomes through a standardized assessment for elementary school (final years) and high school. The goal is to prepare reports and publish the results of the evaluations so that schools can make comparisons with other institutions and plan interventions to support teaching practice, to improve the quality of education.

Between 1995 and 2002, *Secretaria Estadual de Educação - PR* developed the Evaluation Program of the Paraná Educational System, which was initially linked to the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica - PR*, funded by the World Bank, as discussed earlier. The *Programa de Avaliação do Sistema Educacional do Paraná* System should be understood as an educational policy associated with the federal level, because of the State and Basic Education Reform, which promoted the culture of large-scale evaluations and resulted in the implementation of the *Sistema de Avaliação da Educação Básica* (System for Basic Education Evaluation) in 1991. Thus, as occurred in other sectors, and specifically in education, in line with the strategy of a New Way of Governing, a results-oriented education proposal was implemented in the schools of Paraná.

Moreover, it is interesting to note that the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* calls attention to the participation of society in the implementation of the *Avaliação da Educação Básica* of Paraná. "Therefore, the effective involvement of collegiate bodies (School Council, Association of Parents, Teachers, and Staff -APMF, and Student Guild) in the Evaluation Process is fundamental" (Paraná, 2014b, p. 27).

In this sense, Camargo (2018) points out that:

[...] to speak of participation of the *Associação de Pais, Mestres e Funcionários* (Parents, Teachers, and Staff Association), for example, as appears in the documents of the Multi-sector Project for the development of Paraná, one should speak of community participation for improvement in education through productive dialogues. Calling the community to the school only to present results of external evaluations as guilt, as a school that is not being able to educate students, is, to say the least, disrespectful to the school. (Camargo, 2018, p. 98)

The author also states that, in face of this situation, the autonomy granted to schools, which would be disguised under the discourse of defense in favor of community participation, translates as a transfer of responsibilities from the State to the school community, in which "[...] the school and the professionals who work there are blamed for the failure or success of the institution." (Camargo, 2018, p. 98).

However, in the World Bank discourse (Banco Mundial, 1999), the incentive to participate is treated because of the necessary "reinvention of the State", which must leave aside its centralizing and bureaucratic aspect:

While the role of the state continues to be the promotion of basic education for all, it is no longer solely responsible for the delivery of education itself. Local governments, communities, families, individuals, and the private sector now share that responsibility. Education policymakers are redefining the responsibilities of local and central governments and encouraging the development of new decision-making processes, such as decentralization, school autonomy, privatization, and community participation and evaluation of educational institutions. (Banco Mundial, 1999, p. 33)

Therefore, a "discursive hegemony" is produced in this context, whose reforms considered successful, such as those carried out in central countries like the United States, are disseminated, especially in documents from international organizations such as the World Bank to the peripheral countries of capitalism, as an example to be followed (Shiroma et al., 2005).

Another PGE in the Education subcomponent refers to the *Programa de Desenvolvimento de Professores* (Teacher Development Program) – o *Programa Formação em Ação* – (Training in Action Program). "It is understood that the advancement of indicators that measure the quality of education is directly linked to the effective appreciation of teachers and education technicians, with the dissemination of best pedagogical practices" (Paraná, 2014b, p. 39).

The *Programa Formação em Ação* consists of theoretical and practical training for teachers and education technicians, through workshops, and involves the actions of the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* (Education Development Program). According to the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* (Paraná, 2014b), the five impact dimensions of this policy are:

Student performance in standardized tests: The goal of the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* is to improve the quality of education offered by the network. The quality of teaching should be comparable among teachers and schools; therefore, it should be observed through standardized tests, such as Prova Brasil or another to be applied regionally.

- Training of teachers graduating from the PDE: The experience of the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* can serve as a stimulus for teachers to continue their training, to create new projects for implementation in the school where they work. These effects would be felt after the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação*, and could be verified in teachers two years after the end of their training.

- **School environment:** The impacts of the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* can go beyond those actors directly involved, that is, the teaching staff and the students. It is expected that its effects will also be felt in the school environment, in aspects such as violence at school and relationships between the actors. Such impacts can be verified using information collected in surveys, such as the School Census and Prova Brasil (Brazil Exam).

- **Incentives for participating and non-participating teachers (Qualification, attendance, and reduction in absenteeism):** It is expected that the possibility and the selection mechanisms for participation in the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* will induce the network's teachers to improve their continuing education, attendance and reduce absenteeism. This information can be verified in the teachers' records in Secretaria Estadual de Educação Human Resources Department.

- **Improvement of the scientific and academic production of the partner HEIs:** It is expected that the integration with the teachers participating in the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* will both stimulate research and modify topics and approaches taught by the mentors in their home Higher Education Institutions. The impacts in this axis can be observed in databases on the scientific production of the Higher Education Institutions (quantity and quality of faculty publications), and in the performance results of the Pedagogy, and undergraduate courses in the *Exame Nacional de Desempenho de Estudantes - National Student Performance Exam* -. (Paraná, 2014b, pp. 56-57)

Thus, the *Programa de Desenvolvimento da Educação* is an educational policy inscribed in the *Programa Formação em Ação*, whose goal is "[...] to institute a permanent dynamic of reflection, discussion, and construction of knowledge. (Paraná, 2014b, p. 51), supported by Higher Education Institutions and implemented in Basic Education schools.

Finally, the *Programa Renova Escola* (Renovate School Program), which aims to improve school facilities, is the third PGE in the education subcomponent. The *Programa Renova Escola* has been structured around three actions: expansion and/or adaptation of school environments; recovery and repair of school buildings; and acquisition of school equipment and furniture.

According to the *Manual Operativo de Projeto* (Paraná, 2014b, p. 76), "The adequate physical school environment, represented by the set of physical facilities and material resources necessary for the proper functioning of the school, is a facilitator for the learning process and an indicator of quality in education. Thus, we understand that a school that does not offer adequate infrastructure has a great chance of presenting unsatisfactory results concerning learning.

In summary, for the three programs presented, and taking into consideration that it is the State's responsibility to ensure equity of access to school and to guarantee the permanence and learning of students, it is stated that:

The three Education sector programs contribute to the fulfillment of this commitment. The *Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem* (Learning Assessment System Program) tackles the problem of "insufficient information needed for pedagogical guidance on student performance". The *Formação em Ação* (Training in Action) program aims at updating and training education professionals. The *Programa Renova Escola* (Renovate School Program) aims to improve the school environment with the maintenance and conservation of school buildings and the provision of equipment and furniture. (Paraná, 2014b, p. 27)

Thus, to demonstrate the influence of the World Bank in the State of Paraná, in addition to the contract signed between the IBRD and the Government of the State of Paraná - Guarantee Contract for the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* in Paraná number 3766/BR, in 1994, in the amount of US\$96 million and the *Documento de Avaliação do Projeto do Empréstimo Proposto* (Project Evaluation Document of the Proposed Loan) of US\$350 million to the State of Paraná with the guarantee of the Federative Republic of Brazil of 2012 - it is possible to highlight that, just as the World Bank recommends that there should be control of results associated with concepts of quality and evaluation, the actions developed in Paraná, especially about education, incorporate the same perspective.

We also emphasize that the influence of international organizations, such as the World Bank, concerning policies in the peripheral countries of capitalism, is related to the process defined by Barroso (2005) as transnational regulation. In this same perspective, Mello (2014), when discussing the role of the World Bank in the dissemination of transnational policies, stated that:

He was able, throughout his trajectory, to achieve enough legitimacy that his statistical data became a reference, and his staff and documents circulated in governments, non-governmental organizations, universities, and newspapers around the world, with influence in various areas and themes linked to the development "umbrella" debate that he helped consolidate. (Mello, 2014, p. 153)

Therefore, it is possible to state that the transnational regulation of policies can be exercised through the control of rules placed on financing systems, which affect, to a certain extent, the implementation of policies, especially in the field of education. Moreover, transnational regulation can be identified in the cooperation programs offered by central countries to peripheral countries, bringing together technicians from different countries to supposedly conduct investigations to present possible solutions to certain problems. For Barroso (2006):

These programs suggest (impose) diagnoses, methodologies, techniques, and solutions (often in a uniform way) that end up being a kind of "ready-made wardrobe" to which specialists from different countries resort whenever they are asked (by national authorities or public opinion) to give their opinion on the most diverse problems or to present solutions. (Barroso, 2006, p. 45)

Final considerations

Our objective with this article was to present the influence of the World Bank in relation to the educational policies implemented in the State of Paraná, such as the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* and the Programs of the education subcomponent of the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*. Among the three programs of this project - *Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem, Formação em Ação e Renova Escola* - we emphasize the first one to demonstrate the influence of the World Bank mainly regarding the role that the evaluation of the quality of education plays in the continuity of the educational project of international capital.

It is worth noting that the historical dimension and the understanding of the social relations established in capitalist society were considered fundamental theoretical and methodological aspects for the understanding of educational policies in the State of Paraná with the influence of the World Bank. In this way, we observe that both the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* - PR and the programs of the Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná present as their main objective the improvement of the quality of education offered in the State, and that the concern lies essentially in the formation of human capital. Thus, the improvement of school infrastructure, teacher training, and the supply of inputs, which are inscribed in both projects presented, are related to the search for better learning indicators supposedly revealed through large-scale evaluations. These results, in turn, represent for the World Bank the quality of education and, therefore, the ability of a country to compete internationally.

It is worth noting that the historical dimension and the understanding of the social relations established in capitalist society were considered fundamental theoretical and methodological aspects for the understanding of educational policies in the State of Paraná with the influence of the World Bank. In this way, we observe that both the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* - PR and the programs of the Multisectoral Project for the Development of Paraná present as their main objective the improvement of the quality of education offered in the State, and that the concern lies essentially in the formation of human capital. Thus, the improvement of school infrastructure, teacher training, and the supply of inputs, which are inscribed in both projects presented, are related to the search for better learning indicators supposedly revealed through large-scale evaluations. These results, in turn, represent for the World Bank the quality of education and, therefore, the ability of a country to compete internationally.

Another aspect that reveals the influence of the World Bank in Paraná's educational policy refers to the dissemination of the logic that transfers to the subjects the responsibility for the school and its results. This is done under the discourse that constantly encourages the participation and involvement of the community and those who work in the school space. Therefore, similarly to the proposals made by the World Bank, the educational policies presented here demonstrate this convergence, perceived specifically in the proposal to implement the so-called shared management in Paraná schools.

Therefore, we observe that the World Bank influence on the educational policies of the State of Paraná in the managements considered in this study is manifested mainly from the conception that this organization has, whose categories, essentially from the business field (efficiency, effectiveness, quality, competitiveness, evaluation, accountability) are incorporated by public education in Brazil and Paraná, especially from the 1990s, remaining until today.

Therefore, we emphasize that, more than just financing projects such as the *Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica - PR* and the *Projeto Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*, the participation of the World Bank affects the principles that underlie these educational policies. Thus, by incorporating economic criteria from the business field, their real intentions move towards the development of international capital and away from what we truly consider to be quality education.

It should be remembered that:

In the vast majority of times, when one talks about quality education, one has the immediate assumption (let's leave aside, for the moment, deeper assumptions) that it implies: an educational policy that would allow good material conditions (infrastructure, facilities, access to technologies); sufficient financial resources; good teacher training; good working conditions for technicians and teachers; valuing the profession with adequate wages, working hours that include time for study and improvement; adequate curriculum organization; certain pedagogies; innovative forms of teaching and evaluation, etc. The good quality of education, in turn, would be proven by the success in national and international evaluation processes. (Tonet, 2020, pp. 9-10)

The aspects mentioned, which concern the conditions of infrastructure, training, evaluation, etc., are part of the educational policies presented here (*Projeto Qualidade da Educação Básica* and educational programs of the *Multissetorial para o Desenvolvimento do Paraná*) and, without a doubt, are fundamental to meet the needs produced by the conquest of the expansion of education. However, "In itself, an education with all those requirements can perfectly form for the reproduction of bourgeois society." (Tonet, 2020, p. 6).

Quality education, in our view, should be understood from a class perspective. As the dominant hegemony, the education project disseminated by the World Bank and incorporated to a certain extent by the State of Paraná, with respect to the rationale and justification that underlie the adopted educational policies, seeks the conservation of the existing society. Thus, education, in this context, different from what the documents intend to demonstrate, assumes the role of training for the reproduction of the system and not for the overcoming of poverty and social inequalities.

References

- Banco Mundial. (1999). *La educación en América Latina y el Caribe* (Relatório 20248). <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/991981468300538039/pdf/202480SPANISH0Educational0change.pdf>
- Banco Mundial. (2003). *Um Brasil mais justo, sustentável e competitivo: estratégia de assistência ao país 2004 – 2007*. <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/199571467997853678/pdf/361160PORTUGUESE0BOX0327393B.pdf>
- Banco Mundial. (2012). *Documento de Avaliação do Projeto do Empréstimo Proposto no Valor de US\$350 Milhões de Dólares para o Estado do Paraná com a Garantia da República Federativa do Brasil*. (Relatório 67388/BR). <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/465531468015594208/pdf/NonAsciiFileName0.pdf>
- Barroso, J. (2005). O Estado, a educação e a regulação das políticas públicas. *Educação & Sociedade*, 26(92), 725-751. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0101-73302005000300002>
- Barroso, J. (2006). O Estado e a educação: a regulação transnacional, a regulação nacional e a regulação local. Em J. Barroso (Org.). *A regulação das políticas públicas de educação: espaços, dinâmicas e atores* (pp. 41-70). Educa.
- Camargo, K. P. da S. (2018). *Dívida Pública, Banco Mundial e Políticas Sociais: o Financiamento Externo da Política Educacional no Paraná (2011-2017)*. [Dissertação de mestrado, Universidade Estadual do Oeste do Paraná]. Biblioteca Digital de Teses e Dissertações. <http://tede.unioeste.br/handle/tede/3927>
- De Tommasi, L. (2007). Financiamentos do Banco Mundial no setor educacional brasileiro: os projetos em fase de implementação. Em L. De Tommasi, M. Warde, & S. Haddad (Orgs.). *O Banco Mundial e as políticas educacionais* (pp. 195-227). Cortez.
- Figueiredo, I. M. Z. (2005). *A construção da “centralidade da educação básica” na sociedade brasileira e paranaense*. Edunioeste.
- Gonçalves, M. D. de S., Santos, J. M. T. P., Gouveia, A. B., Gabardo, C. V., Locco, L. de A. de, Rech, P. E., Silva, S. T. da, Tavares, T. M., & Arcoverde, Y. F. de S. (2003). A presença do Banco Mundial e do Banco Interamericano no financiamento do Ensino fundamental e médio na Rede Estadual de Ensino do Paraná. *Educar em Revista*, 71-99. <https://doi.org/10.1590/0104-4060.300>
- Instituto Paranaense de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social (Ipardes). (2012a). *Modelo lógico do Programa Formação em Ação*. http://www.ipardes.gov.br/pdf/multissetorial/9_formacao_acao.pdf
- Instituto Paranaense de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social (Ipardes). (2012b). *Modelo lógico do Programa Renova Escola*. http://www.ipardes.gov.br/pdf/multissetorial/3_renova_escola.pdf
- Instituto Paranaense de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social (Ipardes). (2012c). *Modelo lógico do Programa Sistema de Avaliação da Aprendizagem*. http://www.ipardes.gov.br/pdf/multissetorial/4_avaliacao_aprendizagem.pdf
- Mello, H. D. A. (2014). O Banco Mundial e a reforma educacional no Brasil: a convergência de agendas e o papel dos intelectuais. Em J. M. M. Pereira, & M. Pronko (Orgs.). *A demolição de direitos: um exame das políticas do Banco Mundial para a educação e a saúde (1980-2013)* (pp. 153-179). Escola Politécnica de Saúde Joaquim Venâncio.
- Melo, A. A. S. (2005). A mundialização da educação: neoliberalismo e social democracia no Brasil e Venezuela. *Trabalho, Educação e Saúde*, 3(2), 397-408. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S1981-77462005000200008>

- Nogueira, F. M. G., Figueiredo, I. M. Z., & Borges, L. F. (2003). O Projeto Qualidade no Ensino Público do Paraná – PQE: A estratégia da implementação das reformas liberais no Estado. Em F. M. G. Nogueira, & M. L. F. Rizotto (Orgs.). *Estado e Políticas Sociais: Brasil – Paraná* (pp. 85-100). Edunioeste.
- Paraná. (2011). *Lei nº 17.012 14 de dezembro de 2011*. Governo do Estado do Paraná. Casa Civil. <https://www.legislacao.pr.gov.br/legislacao/pesquisarAto.do?action=exibir&codAto=62636>
- Paraná. (2014a). *Projeto Multissetorial Para Desenvolvimento do Paraná: Manual Operativo do Projeto – MOP v. 1*. Secretaria de Estado do Planejamento e Coordenação Geral. https://www.ipardes.pr.gov.br/sites/ipardes/arquivos_restritos/files/documento/2019-09/multissetorial_document.pdf
- Paraná. (2014b). *Projeto Multissetorial Para Desenvolvimento do Paraná: Manual Operativo do Projeto - MOP v. 4*. Secretaria de Estado do Planejamento e Coordenação Geral. Secretaria de Estado e Educação. https://www.ipardes.pr.gov.br/sites/ipardes/arquivos_restritos/files/documento/2019-09/multissetorial_mop_educacao_2014.pdf
- Pronko, M. (2014). O Banco Mundial no campo internacional da educação. Em J. M. M. Pereira, & M. Pronko (Orgs.). *A demolição de direitos: um exame das políticas do Banco Mundial para a educação e a saúde (1980-2013)* (pp. 89-112). Escola Politécnica de Saúde Joaquim Venâncio.
- Shiroma, E. O., Campos, R. F., & Garcia, R. M. C. (2005). Decifrar textos para compreender a política: subsídios teórico-metodológicos para análise de documentos. *Perspectiva*, 23(02), 427-446. <https://periodicos.ufsc.br/index.php/perspectiva/article/view/9769/8999>
- Silva, M. A. da. (2002). *Intervenção e Consentimento: a política educacional do Banco Mundial*. Fapesp.
- Sousa, S. E. de. (2013). *A gestão educacional no Paraná 2011 – 2013*. [Dissertação de mestrado, Universidade Estadual do Oeste do Paraná]. Biblioteca Digital de Teses e Dissertações. <http://tede.unioeste.br/handle/tede/865>
- Tonet, I. (2020). *Educação contra o capital*. Terra sem amos.
- Vior, S., & Cerruti, M. B. O. (2014). O Banco Mundial e a sua influência na definição de políticas educacionais na América Latina (1980-2012). Em J. M. M. Pereira, & M. Pronko (Orgs.). *A demolição de direitos: um exame das políticas do Banco Mundial para a educação e a saúde (1980-2013)* (pp. 113-151). Escola Politécnica de Saúde Joaquim Venâncio.